



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

January 20, 2005

Ms. Myma S. Reingold
Galveston County
123 Rosenberg, Suite 4127
Galveston, Texas 77550-1454

OR2005-00618

Dear Ms. Reingold:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 217362.

The Galveston County District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney") received a request for the "names and places where . . . voters voted more than once . . . [and] how they were caught." You assert that the submitted information is not subject to disclosure under the Act. In the alternative, you claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you raise and have reviewed the information you submitted.

Initially, we address your assertion that the submitted information pertains to an investigation that will be presented to a grand jury and is therefore not subject to the Act. In Open Records Decision No.513 (1988), this office concluded that information obtained pursuant to a grand jury subpoena issued in connection with an investigation is within the grand jury's constructive possession and is not subject to the Act. *See also* Gov't Code § 552.003. However, if an investigation began before any information was submitted to the grand jury, and the grand jury did not formally request or direct all of the governmental body's actions in the investigation, then the information is not deemed to be in the grand jury's constructive possession. The fact that information collected or prepared by a governmental body is submitted to the grand jury, when taken alone, does not mean that the information is in the grand jury's constructive possession when the same information is also held by the governmental body. Open Records Decision No.513 (1988). In this instance, you do not

represent to this office, and it is not otherwise apparent from our review, that the information at issue was prepared or collected at the request or direction of a grand jury. Thus, we conclude that the submitted information is subject to the Act and must be released unless an exception to disclosure is applicable. *Id.* at 4.

You claim that the submitted information may be excepted under section 552.108(a), which excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime.” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See* Gov’t Code §§ 552.108(a)(1), (b)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state that the submitted information relates to a pending criminal investigation. Based upon this representation, we conclude that the release of the submitted information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases). Therefore, you may withhold the submitted information pursuant to section 552.108(a)(1).

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov’t Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body’s intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general’s Open Government Hotline, toll free,


at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Marc A. Barenblat
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MAB/sdk

Ref: ID# 217362

Encl: Submitted documents

c: Mr. Kevin C. Walsh, CPA
Galveston County Treasurer
601 Tremont, Suite 306
Galveston, Texas 77550
(w/o enclosures)